BOX
5
FOLDER
55
Comptroller
1910-1911, 1913

D.M.I.
E.R.L.

CITY OF NEW YORK

DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE

COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE

January 26, 1910.

"Accounts and
Awards"

Robert Adamson, Esq.,

Secretary to the Mayor.

S i r :-

I herewith enclose copy of letter sent to Mr. David S. Beach, Actuary, Bridgeport, Ct., in accordance with the Mayor's request and in response to Mr. Beach's inquiry.

Respectfully,

Wm A Prendergast

Deputy Comptroller.

J.S.

Mr. Herman Ridder

President of the
New Yorker Staats-Zeitung.
182 William Street

Report of Expenditures of Fourth of July Committee 1911.

Contributions

1911 August	24	Collected by Mr Isaac N Seeligman up to date	12336	75	
	.	Interest to June 30. 1911	11	55	
	..	Check from the Comptroller for money advanced to E. J. Sullivan (Athletics)	445	55	
	.	.. .. Brooklyn Borough Bills	190	...	12983 85

City Hall Celebration

					Check No	Voucher No		
June	12	Joseph L. Delafield		Postages Expenses	28	59	35	...
	30	Dieges & Clust	23 John St	Bill for Badges	44	81	37	...
	.	Tiffany & Co	5th Ave & 37th St	.. .. Printing	45	82	168	50
	-	W. A. Johnston	World Office	Ushers, Autos &c	52	89	150	...
	.	Joseph L Delafield		Postage Stamps & Expenses	53	90	35	...
	-	Cash for Stamps		Invitations City Hall Celebr.	56	97	70	...
	.	C H. Murray		Services & Exp. Parade of Nations	62	103	184	50
	-	Chas J. O'Brien	227 William St	Bill for 5000 Programs	64	105	62	...
July	5	Joseph Kelly	189 Ninth Ave	.. .. Reviewing Stand City Hall	70	111	2065	...
	7	Mason Seaman Transp. Co	622 W. 57 St	.. .. Taxi - Charges	71	112	15	20
	18	Smith & Thomson	58 Broad St	.. .. Tags Reviewing Stand	88	134	25	...
	19	John Wanamaker	B'way & 10th St	.. Trousers Parade of Nations	89	135	38	50
	..	Geo F. Kung	401 Fifth Ave	.. Expenses	90	136	64	52
	.	Miss M. J. Pierson	9 Livingston Pl	.. ..	91	137	43	52
	-	William Camph	152 W. 46 St	.. Decoration City Hall	92	138	533	34
	..	Fred. Aldridge	117 Lawrence St	.. do	93	139	100	...
	.	M. A. Bowe	1294 B'way	.. Flowers do	94	140	785	...
	..	J. D. Hadwin		.. Services Parade of Nations	95	141	3	70
	..	Louis Brunner	366 E. 156 St	.. Costumes	96	142	15	...
	-	Frank Bergen Kelley	Essex Fells. N.J.	.. Services	97	143	40	75
	..	Mason Seaman Transp. Co	622 W. 57 St	.. Taxi Cab Charges ..	98	144	4	90
	..	M. Schlesinger	41 Ann St	.. Signs ..	99	145	49	50
	..	J. Keppler c/o Puck		.. Expenses Indian Parade	100	146	74	50
	..	Conn. Cab Co	21 W. 62 St	.. Cab Charges ..	101	147	28	...
	-	Amin & Co	Fulton cor William St	.. Flags ..	102	148	8	50
	..	Alex Konta	43 Exchange Pl.	.. Expenses ..	103	149	237	...
	-	Arthur Farwell	10 W. 40 St	.. Services City Hall Celebr.	104	150	4	...
	-	Federal Printing Co	249 W. 39 St	.. 10.000 Hymn of Liberty	105	151	12	...
	..	Geo. Beaverson	35 Frankfort St	.. Comp of	106	152	7	50
	..	Columbus Awning Co	832 Ninth Ave	.. Flags City College	107	153	7	...
	..	Michael F. Bonney	139th St & St Nicholas Ter	.. ..	108	154	24	...
	28	Dr. Rich F. Murphy	151 E. 83 St	.. Services City Hall Celebr	110	158	22	50
	.	Dieges & Clust	23 John St	.. Badges	111	159	10	50
August	22	Jos. N. Francolini	66 Spring St	.. Expenses Italian Parade	119	167	56	70
							5018	13

Athletic Games

May	27	Dieges & Clust	23 John St	Balance on Bill for Medals last years Celebration	10	34	479	50
June	7	James E. Sullivan	21 Warren St	Advance Payment on Athletic Games	18	46	500	...
							979	50
				Forward			5997	63

1911					Brt over				12983	85			5997	63.
					Manhattan Borough										
June	30	The D. H. Ahrend Co	73 Warren St		Bill for Clerical Work	58	99				4	66			
	"	Andrews & Schoonmaker	27 William St		" - Stenographic Services	59	100				10	25			
	"	Henry H. Curran	55 Park Row		" . Postage & Mailing	60	101				13	34			
	"	do	"	"	" . " & Addr Wash Sq. Celebr	61	102				207	48			
July	3	Triune Printing Co	140 Spring St		" . Printing	65	106				52	80			
	5	The D. H. Ahrend Co	73 Warren St		" . Typewriting & Mailing	68	109				73	18			
	7	Henry H. Curran	55 Park Row		" . Services Wash. Sq. Celebr	72	113				25	...			
	.	H. R. Humphries			- - Inc. Exp. " "	73	114				25	...			
	14	Union Novelty Co	201 E. 14 St		- . Decorations " -	79	125				75	...			
October	19	Harlem Patriotic Society	217 W. 125 St		. . Mt Morris Park Celebration	124	172				507	93	994	64	
					Brooklyn Borough										
May	10	Christensen & Boesen	250 Adam St	Brooklyn	Bill for Printing	4	23				14	50			
	26	John B. Creighton	City Hall	"	Postage Stamps	7	27				10	...			
June	3	B. R Barry	177 Amity St	"	" Services Typewriter	15	43				20	...			
	"	John B. Creighton	Borough Hall	"	. Postage Stamps	23	54				10	...			
	16	Harry B. Ball	"	"	. Clerical Work	32	66				25	...			
	"	John B. Creighton	"	"	Postage Stamps	33	67				10				
	"	Christensen & Boesen	250 Adam St	"	- Printing	36	70				14	25			
	30	do	"	"	. do	47	84				28	...			
	"	Annin & Co	Fulton & Wm Sts	Manhattan	- do	48	85				9	...			
	"	P. J. Collison & Co	339 Adam St	Brooklyn	. do	49	86				7	75			
	"	John B. Creighton	Borough Hall	"	. Clerical Work & Stamps	50	87				22	...			
	-	B. R Barry	177 Amity St	"	- do	57	98				12	...			
	-	The Brooklyn Daily Eagle			- - Badges	63	104				7	50	190	...	
					Bronx Borough										
August	4	Patrick Murphy	373 E. 144 St	Bronx	Bill for Erecting Platform Bronx Celebr	115	163						50	...	
					Queens Borough										
October	16	Geo Schubel	Ridgewood Times	Bklyn	Bill for Queens Boro Celebration	123	171						288	...	
					Singing Societies										
July	18	F. Schostal	1808 Park Ave	Manh.	Bill for City Hall Celebr.	Manh.	83	129			126	50			
	"	David Koos	85 Woodbine St	Bklyn	" . .	Bklyn	84	130			60	...			
	-	Martin Eymer	51 Wright St	Richm.	" . .	Richmond	85	131			103	45			
	-	Albert J Holzer	161 E. 96 St	Manh.	. . .	Bronx	86	132			60	...			
	"	Theo Henninger	380 Second Ave	"	. . Exp. Organizing	Societies	87	133			21	15	371	10	
					Music										
August	14	Thos F. Dowd	169 Dikeman St	Bklyn	Bill for Music Coffey Park	Bklyn	117	165			50	...			
October	20	A. Camera	230 Mott St	Manh	" " " could by mistake not play		125	173			135	...	185	...	
						Forward			12983	85			8076	37	

1911				Brt over			$	12983	85			$ 8076	37
		Fire Works.											
July	5	Julia Flannery	1896 Lexington Ave	Bill for Clerical Work	67	108				$	30 25		
.		Jeven Garage	67 W 118 St	.. .. Auto Services	69	110					50 ...		
August	4	Cons. Fireworks Co	10 Park Pl.	.. Extra Firework-Bklyn	113	161					202 ...		282 25
		Office Expenses.											
May	2	Enterprise Desk Co	26 Beekman St	Bill for Renting Office Furniture	1	1				$	52 85		
.		Typewriter Sales Co	171 B'way	.. .. Typewriter		2					6 ...		
.		Trow Directory Co	202 E. 12 St	.. .. City Directory		3					12 ...		
.		W. Gould Reid	139 Nassau St	.. .. Stationery		4					16 05		
.		Mary Caldwell		Salary		5					20 ...		
.		Fritz Guertler		..		6					20 ...		
.		Mary Caldwell		Petty Cash		7					20 ...		
5		Elbert Latham	World Bldg	Bill for Lettering Office door		8					10 50		
6		Fritz Guertler		Salary		9					30 ...		
..		Mary Caldwell		..		10					20 ...		
..		Edw. Casey		..		11					2 50		
13		Fritz Guertler		.	2	12					30 ...		
..		A. F. McNally		.		13					33 33		
.		Mary Caldwell		..		14					20 ...		
..		Edw Casey		..		15					5 ...		
..		Cash for Stamps				16					100 ...		
20		Fritz Guertler		..	3	17					30 ...		
.		A. F. McNally		..		18					25 ...		
..		Mary Caldwell		..		19					20 ...		
..		Edw. Casey		..		20					5 ...		
.		Mabelle L Brophy		..		21					6 ...		
..		Mary Caldwell		Petty Cash		22					20 ...		
..		Chelsea Press & Larson Hopkins Co		Bill for Printing	5	24					58 25		
24		Mabelle L Brophy		Salary	8	25					4 ...		
26		Chas. J. O'Brien		Bill for Printing	6	26					41 50		
27		Fritz Guertler		Salary	8	28					30 ...		
..		A. F. McNally		..	.	29					25 ...		
..		Mary Caldwell		..	.	30					20 ...		
.		Edw. Casey		..	-	31					5 ...		
..		Mabelle L Brophy		..	.	32					8 ...		
.		Cash for Stamps & Stamped Envelopes			9	33					50 ...		
..		Underwood Typewriter Co		Bill for Rental of Typewr.	11	35					3 50		
..		Am. Addressing & Mailing Co		.. .. Filling in names	12	36					5 40		
June	3	Fritz Guertler		Salary	13	37					30 ...		
..		A. F. McNally		..	-	38					25 ...		
.		Mary Caldwell		.	.	39					20 ...		
..		Edw. Casey		.	.	40					5 ...		
.		Mabelle L Brophy		.	.	41					2 ...		
.		Typewriter Sales Co	49 Park Pl.	Bill for Rental of Typewriter	14	42					3 ...		
.		M. B. Brown		.. .. Printing	16	44					20 ...		
				Forward			$	12983	85	$	859 88	$ 8358	62

Cash advanced by Mr. J. N. Ladigman

1911				Brit over			12983	85	859	88	8358	62
June	3	Chas J. O'Brien	227 William St.	Bill for Printing	17	45			17	50		
	7	Cash for Stamps			19	47			30	...		
	-	Isaac N. Seligmann		. . Rubber Stamps	20	48			1	20		
	9	Fritz Guertler		Salary .	21	49			30	...		
	..	A.F. McNally		..	.	50			25	...		
	..	Mary Caldwell		..	.	51			20	...		
	..	Edw. Casey		.	.	52			5	...		
	..	The Social Register	29 B'way	Bill one Copy Social Register	22	53			3	50		
	11	Chas. J. O'Brien	227 William St	. for Printing	24	55			40	...		
	.	Chelsea Press	98 Fulton St	.. .. do	25	56			36	25		
	.	Mary Caldwell		Petty Cash	26	57			20	...		
	.	Joseph Hawkes	108 Fulton St	Bill for 30 Photo Prints	27	58			15	...		
	16	Fritz Guertler		Salary	29	60			30	...		
	16	A.F. McNally		..	..	61			25	...		
	.	Mary Caldwell		.	.	62			20	...		
	.	Edw. Casey		.	..	63			5	...		
	..	Chelsea Press	98 Fulton St	Bill for Printing	30	64			19	75		
	.	Am. Addressing & Mailing Co	56 Warren St	.. .. Filling in names	31	65			5	27		
	.	Cash for Stamps			34	68			40	...		
	..	Chas J. O'Brien	227 William St	Bill for Printing	35	69			15	...		
	..	Cash for Postal Cards		General Committee Meeting	37	71			15	...		
	23	Fritz Guertler		Salary	38	72			30	...		
	.	A.F. McNally		..	.	73			25	...		
	.	Mary Caldwell		.	.	74			20	...		
	..	Edw. Casey		..	.	75			5	...		
	.	Underwood Typewriter Co	241 B'way	Bill for Rent of Typewriter	39	76			3	50		
	.	Russell & Gray	Pulitzer Bldg	.. .. Newspapers	40	77			28	59		
	..	Am. Addr & Mailing Co	56 Warren St	. .. Filling in Names	41	78			10	81		
	.	Chelsea Press	98 Fulton St	.. . Printing	42	79			13	75		
	..	Mary Caldwell		Petty Cash	43	80			20	...		
	.	Chelsea Press	98 Fulton St	Bill for Printing	46	83			12	85		
	.	Chas J. O'Brien	227 William St	.. .. do	51	88			5	...		
	30	A. E. Hull	Board of Aldermen	Clerical Services	54	91			120	...		
	.	Fritz Guertler		Salary	55	92			30	...		
	.	A.F. McNally		.	..	93			25	...		
	.	Mary Caldwell		.	..	94			20	...		
	.	Edw. Casey		.	..	95			5	...		
	.	Mary Caldwell		Petty Cash	..	96			10	...		
July	3	William A. Johnston		Services & Expenses	66	107			500	...		
	7	Edw. Casey		Salary	74	115			10	...		
	.	Mary Caldwell		..	..	116			40	...		
	.	A.F. McNally		..	..	117			55	...		
	.	Fritz Guertler		..	..	118			30	...		
	14	Chelsea Press	98 Fulton St	Bill for Printing	75	119			2	75		
	.	Fritz Guertler		Salary	76	120			30	...		
	.	Mary Caldwell		..	..	121			20	...		
	..	Edw. Casey		..	.	122			5	...		
				Forward			12983	85	2355	60	8358	62

1911				Brt over				12983	85	2355	60	8358	62
July	14	The World		Bill for Telephone Calls	77	123				1	50		
	"	Merchants Union Ice Co		" " Ice Supply	78	124				2	53		
	.	Great Bear Spring Co		" " Spring Water	80	126				2	...		
	17	U.S. Fidelity & Guaranty Co		" " Indemnity	81	127				30	...		
	"	Enterprise Desk Co		" " Rent of Office Furn.	82	128				5	...		
	22	Fritz Guertler	Salary		109	155				30	...		
	"	Mary Caldwell	"		.	156				20	...		
	"	Edw. Casey	"		.	157				5	...		
	29	Fritz Guertler	"		112	160				30	...		
August	5	do	"		114	162				30	...		
	12	do	"		116	164				30	...		
	19	do	"		118	166				30	...		
	25	do	"		120	168				30	...		
	"	Petty Cash			121	169				8	28		
Septbr	27	Fritz Guertler	Salary, Extrawork & Overtime		122	170				100	...		
Novbr	2	do	Salary. Expenses, Stationery, Carfares & Postage		126	174				70	...	2779	91
							12983	85				11138	53
				Disbursements			11138	53					
				Balance on hand			1845	32					

Recapitulation

Contributions and Repayments from Comptroller's Office	12983	85
Amount paid out by checks according to Vouchers	11138	53
Balance left with J & W. Seligman & Co's Banking House	1845	32

X
CAL
—
Fingal

Compt

Jan.9 1911.k

Dear Mr. Prendergast:

I came over late today after being in bed yesterday with an apparent attack of the grippe, and found your note here. I have to leave early today. I should not have come over at all and am doing only those things which have to be done today. I hope I shall be better tomorrow, and when I come over I shall try to arrange a meeting of the Banking Commission as you request.

Very truly yours,

W. J. Gaynor

Mayor.

Hon. W. A. Prendergast,

Comptroller.

P.S. I think as I said last January that the Mint ought to be abandoned. And I am strong in all financial matters.

11-2-D

X
CAL
—
Fin gen'l

Compt

Jan.9 1911.k

Dear Mr. Prendergast:

I came over late today after being in bed yesterday with an apparent attack of the grippe, and found your note here. I have to leave early today. I should not have come over at all and am doing only those things which have to be done today. I hope I shall be better tomorrow, and when I come over I shall try to arrange a meeting of the Banking Commission as you request.

Very truly yours,

W. J. Gaynor

Mayor.

Hon. W. A. Prendergast,

Comptroller.

P.S. I thought as I said last January that the Mayor ought to be (chairman) of the Board of Estimate & Apportionment & Control & am pleased to find that all do.

11-2-D

CITY OF NEW YORK

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR.

Jan. 9, 1911. m

Dear Mr. Mayor:

I gave the Comptroller your message about the letter the first moment he returned from luncheon. He said that he had started out to luncheon when your letter reached him and he immediately gave it out for publication thinking that "it was due you" that the reason for not holding a meeting of the Banking Commission should be made public. He said that his letter had already been given to the press and he felt that it was only just to you that he give out your answer also. He told me that he had omitted the postscript from your letter in giving it out, as he regarded that as personal. He said he was extremely sorry that he had made the letter public if you did not wish it, but personally he thought it much better. It appears that he gave out the letter the moment it reached him.

Very truly yours,

Robert Adamson

Hon. W. J. Gaynor,

Mayor.

April 18,1911.m

Sir:

I cannot approve the resolution of your board of April 12th amending the classification of the positions of the Finance Department by striking 97 thereof from the exempt class and making them competitive hereafter. Most of the present incumbents of these positions were appointed by the present comptroller, some of them within a few weeks. In order to make such appointments the comptroller turned out their predecessors partly by out and out dismissals and partly by forced resignations. The dismissals were not confined to these 97. There were 176 employes in all turned out, a few of them by forced transfers. Their places were given to others. Nearly all of those turned out had long been employed in the Finance Department, one for even 37 years, and no cause was assigned or suggested for their dismissal except politics. Many of them brought suit in the courts for reinstatement on the ground that they were illegally dismissed, namely, because of their politics or party affiliations being different to those of

the comptroller. One of these suits, that of Garvey, selected as a test, was tried about March 1st. The jury returned a verdict that the dismissal was for political reasons. The comptroller was examined as a witness and testified without hesitation that he did not consider the efficiency of those he turned out. The following is his answer to the court on that head, viz.:

"By the court: The question is whether you considered the question of the efficiency of the former incumbents, that is the point. Answer. I did not."

The Comptroller also reiterated many times on the witness stand his motive of politics in making the dismissals and his estimate of the provision of the civil service law which forbids dismissals for political opinions or affiliations. The following passages, selected out of many of the same kind, will suffice, viz.:

"I feel that it is inexpedient to try and enforce something upon human beings that human nature itself resents. That is my idea about that feature of the law."

"A cashier came to me and said the only reason I am being fired is because I am a Democrat, and I said I don't know of any better reason."

"The law says you must not dismiss a man on account of his politics. You cannot dismiss men for their politics but you can on account of the color of their hair. What is the use having any such provision in the civil service law. You know it is hypocrisy and that is the plain English of it."

The provision of the civil service law of which the comptroller thus spoke on the witness stand, is in section 23, and is as follows:

"No recommendation or question under the authority of this act shall relate to the political opinions or affiliations of any person whatever; and no appointment or selection to or removal from an office or employment within the scope of the rules established as aforesaid, shall be in any manner affected or influenced by such opinions or affiliations." And section 1866 of the Penal Law makes the violations of this provision an indictable offense.

I came into the mayor's office determined from long conviction and habit that no one in any of the 16 departments and bureaus under my control should be dismissed during my term of office for any political reason, and that determination has been carefully kept. I believed that the welfare and proper government of the city required that I follow

that course, and that the enlightened, humane and decent sentiment of the community in which I live was in accord with me, to say nothing of the positive provision of the statute which I have cited. But while I have been adhering to this course, I have been looking on with feelings of regret at these dismissals for political reasons from week to week from the Department of Finance, an elective office over which the mayor has no control. Many of the victims thus deprived of their livings, some of them after a generation and more of service to the city, applied to me, but I could not help them.

And all of this occurred without any objection or protest from any quarter, so far as I have observed. Sometimes I could not help feeling, therefore, that my views were not shared by my fellow citizens, and that it would please them just as well if I should also follow the course of discharging employes of the city and appointing others in their places for political reasons. But I could not bring myself to believe it.

My feeling is that I cannot approve this resolution without making myself a party to a moral wrong and a violation of law. I should be helping to entrench in these positions the present incumbents

who obtained them in violation of law. If these positions may lawfully be put in the competitive class (which has not heretofore been thought to be the case, and about which there is now much doubt), the present incumbents should be obliged to compete like every one else in the examination to make up an eligible list from which to fill them. If the comptroller will consent to this, then we can proceed to make the positions competitive, if lawful, and fill them by competition. As the case now is, the former incumbents were summarily removed by the comptroller for political reasons, and to enable him to appoint in their stead persons of his own political opinions and affiliation. That violation of law being accomplished, the attempt now is to get your board and the mayor to ratify and entrench it. I cannot bring myself to do it. Since I have been mayor I have done much for the sake of peace, and to prevent petty political obstructions, so that the work of the city could be done in a broad spirit; but I cannot go to this extent without becoming a party to a wrong. I regret that the civil service reform association was unwittingly drawn into the espousal of this application.

Very truly yours,

W. L. Mayor.

Hon. John C. McGuire,
President, Municipal Civil Service Commission.

Department of Finance
City of New York

William A. Prendergast, Comptroller

April 19, 1911.

7

Honorable William J. Gaynor,
Mayor,
City of New York.

S i r :

Your letter of April 18th, addressed to the Municipal Civil Service Commission, is another exhibition of your recklessness of statement. For so many years you have been in the habit of calling people names, misrepresenting their positions and brow-beating them in general, for your own private ends, that this practice has become a passion with you. I want you distinctly to understand that you have now arrived at that stage of your career where you are going to find that there are some men who will not tolerate these propensities. I intend to hold you to strict accountability for every untruthful statement you make regarding me.

The purpose of your letter is undoubtedly to convey the impression to the public that I have sought to cover a large number of exempt employes into the competitive division of the classified service. You say, "I regret that the Civil Service Reform Association was unwittingly drawn into the espousal of this application".

The application originated with the Civil Service Reform Association. It was never suggested by me or by any one in my behalf, and you knew this when you made this statement. When the suggestion to classify these places was made to the Municipal Civil Service Commission, it immediately ordered a day for a hearing and informed me of the fact. I could not attend upon that day and another day was named by the Commission. The second hearing was adjourned by the Commission itself. I wished it known that I was not averse to arguing this question before the Commission, and therefore reminded President McGuire of the fact that no new hearing had been set. In response to my letter a new hearing was named. I was notified to appear and the Civil Service Reform Association appeared as the <u>applicant</u> at that hearing.

If you had taken the trouble you would have learned from those who were present at the hearing that I opposed placing

auditors in the competitive class. Further, I took the ground that I was in a position to make better selections of expert accountants than could be made from an eligible list and that their positions should be in the exempt class. In regard to the other places no reasonable opposition could be entered for the simple reason that many similar places are classified in other departments with the exception of cashiers. The whole proceeding was a voluntary one on the part of your Commission. If any one is to be reprobated by you it is this Commission, who are your appointees. Whatever explanation I am making in this letter is not being made for your benefit but that the public may understand my position and the untruthfulness of your statements.

You say: "There were 176 employes in all turned out, a few of them by forced transfers". This is another exhibition of either woeful ignorance or deliberate misrepresentation. In the first place, when I came into this department, there were only 145 exempt places. 139 were filled when I took office. 18 of these employes resigned of their own accord. 22 tendered their resignations at my request. 4 have been dismissed under charges. One has retired with a pension. 53 have been dismissed by me. 40 are still in the service and among the places held by them are many of the highest salaried positions in this department. These figures dispose effectually of your claim that 176 people were dismissed.

You speak of one who was dismissed who had been here 37 years. To whom can you refer? Certainly to no one in the flesh because no such case exists. If you really knew half as much of the Charter as you pretend to know you would realize this - that any man in the Finance Department who has been in the city service for 35 years can, upon application, retire upon a pension of half pay. Therefore, any man who had been here for 37 years could avail himself of such retirement. One man in an exempt position who came within the retirement period, applied to me for retirement and I promptly acquiesced in it. Two others in the competitive class have also availed themselves of this charter privilege.

A man who has been in the city service for over 30 years I found to be incompetent for the position he was holding. He tendered his resignation but asked me if I would not give him another position for which he felt he would be competent, and I gave him such a place at $3,500 a year.

You assert that you have not tolerated any dismissals for political reasons. I cannot help recalling a few cases in point, which show the hollowness of your statement. A deputy commissioner in charge of a prominent department in Brooklyn desired to be kept in the service. His friends approached you and you snarlingly told them:

"That man worked against me".

The man lost his job. Why did you force him out? Was not the reason political"

In another board over which you have absolute control the secretary had been in the city service, I think for nearly 40 years. He was put out immediately after you had made your new appointments in that board, and his place was given to a Democratic district leader in Brooklyn. The district leader is a fine young fellow and I am glad he got the job.

In another board when your appointees went in they found a Republican secretary. He was promptly dispensed with. I asked one of the commissioners why he had been dismissed and he stammeringly told me that the secretary had been in the habit of having people call upon him on political business. Would it not be more honest to come right out and frankly say: "We wanted his job and we took it from him"? I could give two columns of similar instances but I think that these few will suffice. Furthermore, an analysis of your appointments and mine will prove that I have appointed more Democrats than you have Republicans.

You seem to think that all of the positions included in the list of 97 places which your Commission proposed to classify are filled by appointees of mine. Such is not the case. 12 are now vacant and 29 were in the service before I came here and have been retained by me. Of the 145 exempt places at my disposal in this department there are only 129 filled at the present time. This reduction I have made for reasons of good administration and economy. The fact that such places have not been used by me disproves conclusively your claim that I am using these exempt positions for purely political reasons.

I welcome your quotation of my testimony in the Garvey trial. My criticism of the Civil Service Law is a well founded one as every honest, practical man, who is familiar with the law, knows. I have never pretended that I would not recognize my party friends in making appointments. I believe that the hewers of wood and the drawers of water should be recognized. All I have asked is that every recommendation made to me shall be of a man whose character is good and who has the requisite qualities of competency. I have never asked a political leader to subsist on "a few kind words", and what is more I never will.

The answer to your charge of partisanship is to be found in the general character of the work being done by the Comptroller's office at the present time. That stands for itself, and instead of attacking other officials who are trying to do their duty, I advise you to turn your attention to some of the departments for which you are responsible and which are at the present time being mismanaged in the grossest way.

You say in your letter that you cannot be a party to a wrong. Who would ever suspect you? The morning papers indicate that the general depositors of the Carnegie Trust Company will be paid 60

cents on the dollar. This means that the City of New York will realize 60 per cent upon the $650,000 of the $1,000,000 deposited in that company by one of your appointees who is still in office, and whose powers you propose to enlarge materially by your new charter, while his very presence in that office is a stinging disgrace to the City of New York.

Respectfully,

W. A. Prendergast

Comptroller.

Apr 19/1911

Re to Mayors Letter
of Apr 18. ii-Re to
Civil Service Resolution
Re to Finance Dept

April 24,1911.k

S i r :

In my communication to you of April 18 disapproving of the action of your board in making a long list of positions in the Finance Department competitive, which had theretofore been non-competitive, I stated that it should not be done unless the comptroller consented that the recently appointed incumbents who took the place of those turned out by him for political reasons should enter the competition to make up the list from which to fill the positions. Will you be so good as to send a note to the comptroller asking for such consent by him. To first turn out a lot of incumbents and fill their places with political henchmen, and then make the positions competitive, without subjecting the new appointees to the competitive examination, is only to entrench them in office for life, or until removed for cause, which is the only way to get rid of one holding a competitive position, although he may not have got into it by competition. I have spoken with the president of the Civil Service Reform Association, and also with the corporation counsel who advises

me that the comptroller's consent will make the filling of these positions by competition feasible at once.

Yours very truly,

W. J. Gaynor

Mayor.

John C. McGuire, Esq.,

President Municipal Civil Service Commission.

September 29th, 1911.

Sir:

Please have sent to me copies of the records in your office showing the dismissal of Peter Aitken and Frank B. Doran by the Comptroller. I would like to have copies of the certificates of dismissal. I should like also to have copies of all papers and records showing how Doran was restored to the list, and appointed in the water department. My information is that he was an embezzler in the Comptroller's office and ran away to avoid arrest; that he was dismissed for absence from duty; that Aitken was dismissed for permitting him to embezzle money; that afterwards the Comptroller canceled Doran's dismissal and allowed him to resign, but that he never withdrew the charge against Aitken of suffering Doran to embezzle money. Please see that this letter does not get in the hands of any one who will immediately communicate to the Comptroller its contents.

Very truly yours,

W. J. Gaynor,

Mayor.

James Creelman, Esq.,
President Municipal Civil Service Commission,
City of New York.

Duplicate

November 17, 1911. k

Dear Mr. Fisher:

I am returning the specifications for the purchase of horses. The purchase of all supplies under the charter rests with the heads of departments. They may not lawfully delegate their judgment to the Comptroller. I am aware of no authority by which the Comptroller can reject anything which the head of a department desires to purchase, nor has the Board of Estimate and Apportionment any right to curtail the powers of the heads of departments. The Comptroller simply audits bills for things purchased. Please show this to the Comptroller so that the matter may be considered before it is put before me again.

Very truly yours,

W. Gaynor

Mayor.

Edmund D. Fisher, Esq.,
Deputy Comptroller,
New York City.

March 17th, 1913. s

Dear Mr. Comptroller:

I shall be very glad to attend the opening of the Municipal Library, but I doubt whether I should make "the" address, as there are others much more familiar with the subject, including yourself. My knowledge of the subject was derived principally from the Commissioner of Accounts going on two years ago, and it is therefore probably not up to date.

Very truly yours,

W. J. Gaynor

Mayor.

Hon. William A. Prendergast,
Comptroller,
New York City.

PCW/C
7/2/13

MEMORANDUM FOR MR. BRUERE
RELATIVE TO BOARD OF ESTIMATE CALENDAR JULY 3

Financial Matters

Item 30 - matter of 454 additional patrolmen. Comptroller's report recommending approval of the use of funds in the 1913 budget. You have read our letter to the comptroller.

Item 36 - Comptroller's report recommending the acquisition of three farms in the town of Goshen, Orange County, for the department of correction, $47,100. You recall our letter to the comptroller on this matter also. I recommend that you urge him to have this matter referred to a committee of the board.

Item 60 - report of the comptroller recommending the issue of $61,000. revenue bonds for fire hose. About a month or two ago, when the last authorisation for this purpose was made, the comptroller's report stated that no additional funds would be provided for fire hose until the specifications were modified in order to throw open the bidding to various manufacturers, because under the old specifications the bidding was limited to the Eureka Company, with the result that an excessive price was charged the city. I suggest that you ask the comptroller if these modifications have been made and if they are satisfactory to him.

PC-M.